

Meeting Minutes

Meeting: Port Botany Community Consultative Committee – Meeting No. 27

Held: Tuesday 18 August 2020, 5.30pm-6.30pm
Online Webex video conferencing

Present:

Mal-Jagdev Imrich (MI) - Community	Marie Gibbs (MG) – Patrick Stevedores
John Burgess (JB) – Community	Jennifer Stevenson (JS) – Hutchison
	Dozie Egeonu (DE) - Hutchison
Peter Fagan (PF) – Community	
Patrick Medway (PM) – Bayside Chamber of Commerce	Mark Bernhardt (MB) – Origin Energy
Dylan Parker (DP) – Electorate Officer for Member for Maroubra	Jos Kusters (JK) – Caltex
Leigh Heaney (LH) – Electorate officer for Member for Kingsford Smith	Gary McKay (GM) – Caltex
Erin Barker (EB) - EPA	Aldo Costabile (AC) – Elgas Limited
James Goodwin - EPA	Peter Armenis – DP World
	Rabi Medina (RM) – ACFS
Clare Harley (CH) – Bayside Council	Mark Walker (MW) - Qenos
Rachel Ng (RN) - Randwick City Council	Jonathan Lafforgue (JL) – NSW Ports
Catherine Blaine (CB) – Port Authority of NSW	Alison Wedgwood (AW) – NSW Ports
	Marika Calfas (MC) – NSW Ports
Roberta Ryan (RR) – Chairperson	Vida Cheeseman (VC) – NSW Ports
Stella Cimarosti (SC) – Minute taker	Sarah Downey (SD) – NSW Ports
	Trevor Brown (TB) – NSW Ports

Apologies:

Item	Description	Action/Responsibility
1	Welcome, Apologies and Introductions	
1.1	Apologies Greg Walls – NSW Ports Charles Abela – Community Lynda Newnam – Community Bronwyn Englaro – Randwick Council John Carnohan – Bayside BEC Russell Brown – ACFS Michael Kinnell – Origin Energy Phil Jones – Quantem Oscar Guillen (OG) - Randwick City Council Paul Pickering - Community	
2	Actions arising from previous meeting	

Meeting Minutes

2.1	<p>Port Botany boat ramp repairs to light CB confirmed new lights have been ordered and Port Authority are awaiting delivery before completing the repairs. Timing will be confirmed.</p> <p>JB noted that it was six months since the problem was reported and work hasn't yet commenced and would like to be emailed with the timing.</p>	<p>CB to advise JB timing of repair work.</p>
3	<p>NSW Ports business update</p>	
3.1	<p>CEO update – Marika Calfas RR welcomed MC, the CEO of NSW Ports to the meeting.</p> <p>MC thanked attendees for participating in the meeting virtually. Special thanks were given to the community representatives for their time commitment in attending the CCC meetings.</p> <p>MC provided a COVID-19 update:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - At the start of the year when COVID-19 first came about it was mostly focused in China. NSW Ports saw disruption at this time as exports/imports couldn't get in or out of China. About 40% of imports and 20% of exports are traded with China. This was problematic, particularly for refrigerated containers. This impact lessened when China reopened operations. - As the situation progressed COVID-19 restrictions were put in place in Australia at both a state and federal level. In some cases requirements were different across states. Other countries also introduced their own restrictions. This was challenging to manage and has continued however, things have eased and the restrictions have been more consistent. - The NSW Government also implemented a public health order for vessels that prohibited crews from leaving their vessels. In response to this NSW Ports had to ensure that the loading and unloaded of vessels was being done in a way that met the public health order. Some processes that were previously manual were moved to digital systems as a result of this. - NSW Ports also saw increased scrutiny from police and the defence force as they are ensuring the rules are being followed. We had to make sure there was no cross contamination between enforcement, NSW Ports staff and port workers. An outbreak amongst staff at the port would mean port operations would be at risk. New procedures were put in place to protect staff and port operations. - NSW Ports has carried out a trial with NSW Health that involves a 45 minute rapid test. This may be rolled out in the port in the future. - Trade during COVID-19 has changed. There has been an increase in imports of disinfectants, long life food products, acetone and diesel. Imports of unleaded fuel, vehicles and aviation fuel have decreased. - At the end of June container exports were down by about 5% and bulk liquid storage was down by about 8% at the port. <p>Port Botany Noise Complaints:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NSW Ports has recorded a rise in noise complaints since lockdown restrictions started. A low frequency noise is being reported and the source of the noise has not been identified. NSW Ports is taking this seriously and this will be discussed in the meeting. <p>Other updates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NSW Ports are aware of community concern after the recent explosion in Beirut. It was a terrible tragedy. Storage of ammonium nitrate in an urban environment for a six year period would not occur at Port Botany as it is a heavily regulated environment. In NSW there are maximum periods of time 	

Meeting Minutes

	<p>that goods can be stored. Ammonium nitrate can only be stored on a wharf for 12 hours and there are limits on the amount that can be brought in.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The NSW Ports and Patricks rail extension project is ongoing. Stage one has been commissioned. - ARTC's business case for the Port Botany freight rail line duplication has been approved and planning approval has been provided by DPIE. The project is expected to be completed by 2024. 	
3.2	<p>Development projects update Port Botany Rail Duplication AW noted that the update was provided by MC as per the above item.</p>	
3.3	<p>Corporate affairs update VC thanked everyone who provided feedback in the survey for the Molineux Point signage project. Work to develop signage for surrounding landmarks is underway. Some drone photography is being carried out and drafts for the signage will be shared soon for feedback.</p> <p>VC noted that the new website would be live later this week. The new website has features to enable regular community updates based on feedback. NSW Ports encourages everyone to sign up for news and notifications once the site is live.</p>	
4	Committee member updates	
4.1	<p>Port Authority: Port Botany community assets CB noted that general maintenance continues on the Penrhyn Estuary. Port Authority are looking to do some work on the bird hide to refresh signage.</p> <p>Port Authority are also doing some work with NSW Ports at Molineux Point to upgrade the lighting in the area. This work will continue for the next few weeks.</p>	
4.2	<p>Port Botany Expansion operational update Patrick: MG noted that a crane was removed in March bringing the total number of cranes to 8. Approximately 300 metres of the rail line has been built. There is still some construction remaining for stage one. Three ARMG cranes were delivered to site in March and are currently going through commissioning which will continue until the end of the year.</p> <p>Hutchison Ports: JS advised that since March operations have been continuing as normally as they can. JS introduced Dozie Egeonu (environmental engineer) who would be attending the CCC meetings moving forward.</p>	
4.3	<p>Tenant developments No updates to report</p>	
5	HSE update	
5.1	<p>Summary of complaints/incidents AW noted that since April an increase in noise complaints have been received in relation to a low frequency throbbing noise.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 31 complaints have been received by NSW Ports since the May community report. Additional complaints have also been made directly to the EPA and Randwick Council. - In response to the complains NSW Ports has: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Visited affected residents o Attended noise surveys with the EPA and Randwick Council o Held fortnightly meetings with the EPA and Randwick Council o Gathered data on ship movements, weather conditions and other operational data to try and identify patterns - At this stage a single source hasn't been identified. There is no simple explanation for why this noise is an issue now as the port is operating as normal with no changes to shipping operations. 	

Meeting Minutes

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The rise in complaints may be due to the change in background noise due to COVID-19 restrictions. There is less traffic on the roads, less on-ground airport operations (including during overnight curfew hours), less planes flying and reduced industrial operations. This is a theory being tested. - It is not uncommon to receive additional complaints in winter due to weather conditions - We can't rule out external sources for all of the complaints received - Acoustic noise consultants have been engaged to analyse noise monitoring data and undertake additional noise monitoring at affected residences. - NSW Ports is looking into installing an additional permanent noise monitoring device closer to residents. <p>AW advised that since the rise in complaints NSW Ports has carried out a review of their complaints management procedure and has implemented a new system to help capture complaints and analyse them. A new online complaints form on the NSW Ports website feeds directly into the new system. A 24 hour phone line has also been launched. The new online form and 24 hour phone line allow complaints to be investigated by port officers in real time and record data such as current weather conditions.</p> <p>NSW Ports is taking this matter very seriously and we are committed to continuing to work with the relevant authorities and impacted residents, as well as provide further communications to the communities surrounding the port.</p> <p>EB noted that Port Botany is a complex environment with a range of noise sources. The EPA has received a lot of complaints since April. As there are a range of sources and also regulators it is essential for NSW Ports, Council and the EPA to work together to sort out the issue. No new noise sources have been identified on the premises regulated by the EPA. Noise monitoring has been carried out and the EPA continue to work collaboratively with NSW Ports.</p> <p>RN noted that council are continuing with fortnightly meetings with the EPA and NSW Ports. As has already been said the source hasn't been identified. Councillors have set some Council resolutions that will be raised and the mayor has written to the minister. No new complaints have been received over the last few weeks.</p> <p>PF noted that the noise is more noticeable than it ordinarily is but it is a noise that has always been heard. PF advised he has always thought it was the noise of ship engines. The noise he hears depends often of the weather and the direction of the wind. The sound goes through the night. Sometimes reversing sounds are heard but this has gotten much better since squawkers were implemented. Occasionally big thumps can also be heard when a container is dropped. He had just assumed with COVID that the overall noise levels for the area is lower so the port noise is more noticeable.</p> <p>JB agreed with PF and added that the number of complaints and commentary on social media is alarming. JB agreed this is probably due to the lack of background noise and noted this will be a challenge to resolve.</p> <p>LH added that the electoral office has also received a number of complaints. The complaints are as has been previously described.</p> <p>JG noted that the EPA has a lot of historical data that is able to be analysed and used to explore some possibilities.</p>	
5.2	<p>Port Botany Expansion Rail noise NSW Ports have not received any rail noise complaints associated with the Port Botany Expansion.</p>	
5.3	<p>Biosecurity</p>	

Meeting Minutes

	<p>TB advised that the key focus has been around managing COVID-19 risk. NSW Ports will also be updating their biosecurity procedures to include vertebrate species.</p> <p>JB commented that another incident has occurred where containers have been lost at sea. JB questioned if there was a process put in place by either NSW Ports or Port Authority to mitigate this?</p> <p>TB advised that responsibility for securing cargo on vessels sits with the master of the vessel. There may be an international authority that deals with matters such as this.</p> <p>JB noted that this has happened twice in the last two years which would indicate that something isn't being done to ensure vessels are following the rules.</p> <p>RR commented that this isn't something managed by NSW Ports.</p> <p>JB emphasised that someone needs to be responsible for this – how to we address this?</p>	
6	Other business	
6.1	<p>Kamay Ferry Wharves Proposal</p> <p>This is a Transport for NSW project. They have been in touch with community members to seek input and are also running "Have Your Say" forums. Information on the project and how to provide feedback can be found at: https://www.rms.nsw.gov.au/projects/kamay-ferry-wharves/index.html</p> <p>VC noted that community forums and consultation had been carried out. TfNSW are happy to take any questions or feedback on the project.</p>	
6.2	<p>Cruise Passenger Terminal</p> <p>No further updates as per May community report: The Port Authority of NSW issued a project update in April 2020 to confirm that the NSW Government has made the decision to place the Cruise Capacity Detailed Business Case on hold for a period of up to 18 months and that they will be pausing all consultation activities until further notice. If you have any questions please direct these to: haveyoursaycruise@portauthoritynsw.com.au</p>	
6.3	<p>Sir Joseph Banks Park</p> <p>JB commented that NSW Ports were working with Bayside Council to do some work in the park. Is there any update?</p> <p>VC noted that NSW Ports have been liaising with council however, a lot of this work has been put on hold due to COVID-19. NSW Ports will come back to the group with an update.</p>	VC to provide update on work.
11	Next meeting	
Next meeting	<p>Tuesday, 10 November 2020 5:30 – 7:00 pm Location: TBA</p>	
	<p>These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair</p> <p>Signed: Roberta Ryan Date: 17/09/2020</p>	