

Meeting Minutes

Meeting: Port Botany Community Consultative Committee – Meeting No. 32

Held: Tuesday 10th August 2021, 5.30pm-7pm
Online (via WebEx Meeting)

Attendees	
<p>Community members Charles Abela John Burgess Peter Fagan Mal Jagdev-Imrich Paul Pickering</p> <p>Council representatives Bronwyn Englaro – Randwick City Council Clare Harley – Bayside Council</p> <p>Electorate Offices Leigh Heaney – Office of Hon Matt Thistlethwaite</p> <p>Port Authority of NSW Catherine Blaine</p> <p>Business representatives Russell Brown – ACFS Lisa Rebeiro – ACFS Jos Kusters – Ampol Gary McKay – Ampol Peter Armenis – DP World Creagh Debrabander – Elgas Limited</p>	<p>Dozie Egeonu – Hutchison Karen Jones – Opal Mark Bernhardt – Origin Energy Michael Kinnell – Origin Energy George Tanevski – Origin Gus May – Patrick Terminals Mark Walker – Qenos Steve Barclay – Quantem Derrick Quinlivan – SafeWork NSW Pami Kohli – Vopak Alan Chambers – Vopak Jennifer Stevenson –</p> <p>ARTC (guest speakers) Alec Brown Ben Vardanega Jess Spencer</p> <p>Transport for New South Wales (guest speakers) Liz Hirst Nick Armaos - JHSW</p> <p>NSW EPA Erin Barker</p> <p>Sydney Water Ian Fairbain (guest speaker).</p> <p>NSW Ports representatives Bryan Beudeker Sarah Downey Jonathan Lafforgue Sophie Lodge Catherine Pemberton</p> <p>Sophie Alais – Minute taker Roberta Ryan – Chairperson</p>
Apologies	
Greg Walls – NSW Ports	

Meeting Minutes

Item	Description	Action/ Responsibility
1	Welcome, Apologies and Introductions	
1.1	<p>RR welcomes everyone to the meeting.</p> <p>RR asks for permission to record the meeting for the purpose of the minutes. No members have any objections. EB clarifies that the minutes are a summary of what is said and not a transcript. RR confirms that the minutes are a summary and are not word for word.</p> <p>Apologies from GW.</p> <p>RR introduces CP and SL, new members of the NSW Ports team.</p> <p>RR notes for the agenda that Lynda Newham has decided to leave the CCC after 13 years. RR says that Lynda has been a member from the very early days and has been an informed and energetic representative of the community. Other members endorse RR's words. RR thanks Lynda for her years of service and wishes her luck on her next endeavours.</p> <p>RR notes that Aldo Costabile has left Elgas, also a member from the beginning. RR thanks Aldo for his excellent contribution to the CCC and welcomes his replacement, CB.</p>	
2	Last meeting's minutes.	
2.1	<p>RR asks for people to approve the previous minutes. JB and JL endorse the last meeting's minutes.</p> <p>JB asks a question about the previous minutes. JB says that an action was that GW was to follow up on Ausgrid cable connection between La Perouse and Kurnell.</p> <p>RR says she is sorry to have missed putting that item on the agenda plus GW is an apology for this meeting. RR asks JB if it is a time sensitive issue and if not, can it be on the agenda for the next meeting?</p> <p>JB says it is not a time sensitive issue so he is very happy for it to be on the agenda for the next meeting in November.</p>	<p>GW- follow up question on the Ausgrid cable connection between La Perouse and Kurnell</p>
3	Actions arising from the last minutes: Foreshore Beach Water Quality (EB); Sir Joseph Banks Park Masterplan (CH) and NSW Ports Molineux Point signage project (SD).	
3.1	<p><i>Foreshore Beach Water Quality.</i> See section 4 – guest speaker Iain Fairbairn from Sydney Water.</p> <p><i>Sir Joseph Banks Park Masterplan</i> CH says Council has obtained a grant for a regional play space at Sir Joseph Banks Park - it will be a nature play space and be complementary to the character of the park. At this stage, CH says that council do not have a plan for the large animal sculptures</p> <p><i>Molineux Point signage</i> SD updates the group on Molineux Point signage. VC has handed over the project to SD. SD is looking at the designs and pushing for the signage to be updated.</p> <p>JB says it had been a long time and asks when there will be progress.</p>	<p>RR requests that Molineux Point signage remains on the agenda for the next meeting.</p>

Meeting Minutes

	<p>SD said the group was surveyed in May 2020. Covid-19 has played a role in delaying the project, but it is moving forward.</p> <p>JB says he drove past Molineux Point recently and it is the same condition as before.</p> <p>RR says Molineux Point can remain on the agenda as a matter arising.</p>	
4	Sydney Water - Iain Fairbairn (IF), Head of Wastewater and Environment	
4.1	<p>IF gives a presentation (see the Attached).</p> <p>PP asks if Sydney Water has taken steps to inform people that Foreshore Beach is used for overflow events so people know not to swim.</p> <p>IF says there is permanent signage to inform people that the beach may be impacted by sewer overflow. Overflows only occur in wet weather. In other parts of Sydney, an overflow event may just be stormwater.</p> <p>PP says that when you drive by Foreshore Beach it smells badly. PP notes that the sewer overflow may be impacted by bad weather in another part of Sydney, given how large the sewer system is.</p> <p>IF agrees and says that if signs are there all the time, they can fade into the background in people's minds. IF says perhaps there should be a way to inform people in real time when overflows happen.</p> <p>CA asks how long it takes for the odour to disappear after an overflow. CA says it can smell at Foreshore Beach even in dry weather.</p> <p>IF says that if Sydney Water did a survey of local residents they would inform them that the area smelt even during dry weather. The smell is likely coming from the pipes themselves and the access chambers. IF says that after an overflow, the smell can impact an area for 3 – 7 days. Reason for this is the pipes and IF says that Sydney Water are looking into fixing it.</p> <p>CA says that given what IF has explained when there is stress on the system, the sewer overflows. But CA says it often overflows into the council drainage system, especially given that Botany is a low area.</p> <p>IF says that in wet weather, overflows can happen. However, overflows should not happen in dry weather, so if it does, call the Sydney Water 24/7 hotline.</p> <p>PF asks whether Sydney Water has done modelling on how the sewage overflows that affect Foreshore Beach disperse across Botany Bay. For example, does contaminated water remain in sufficient concentration to impact beaches to the south and west such as Brighton-Le-Sands and Kurnell, and beaches to the east such as Congwong and Little Congwong?</p> <p>IF says he believes it does not affect any beaches to the south but there has been no modelling done. IF says it is important to remember that wastewater is an organic type of pollutant, so it does degrade and dissipate. IF says that the area of Botany Bay does not get flushed out well, so it does have an effect. IF says Foreshore Beach is a difficult beach to make sure the water quality is good.</p> <p>IF says he is happy for anyone to contact him outside the meeting with questions.</p> <p>RR thanks IF for joining the meeting as a guest speaker.</p>	

Meeting Minutes

5	Sydney Gateway - Future program of works (realignment of Qantas Drive/Airport Drive) – Liz Hirst, Senior Communications and Stakeholder Engagement Manager– TfNSW	
5.1	LH from TfNSW and NA from JHSW present to the group (See Attachment). There are no questions.	
6	ARTC - Botany Rail Duplication Update – Alec Brown	
6.1	AB and BV from ARTC present to the group (see Attachment). JS from ARTC also joins. There are no questions.	
7	Operations update - JL	
7.1	JL provides an update on Port and general Port operations. JL says that last year was a record year for the ports which is a reflection in the increase in consumer spending habits during lockdown plus generous government stimulus packages. JL says that fuel is a different story. Diesel imports increased by 10 percent due to the end of the drought and an increase in farming. Unleaded petrol stayed the same, while aviation fuel dropped by 85 percent. JL said that Port Botany has remained resilient. Container terminal operations have been impacted by international demands and record movement of containers from major hubs and ports which has a flow on effect on schedules and berthing's. There has also been a huge demand for containers themselves. JL says that media articles saying that packages will not arrive before Christmas are incorrect. JL says there has been an early uplift in volume because businesses are ordering early. JL says there have been no issues with the workforce due to covid. JL says they have been not affected by the increased restrictions of south-west local government areas because port workers are considered essential and thus exempt. JL says NSW Ports is the first port in Australia to have a vaccination program for seafarers on ships for the ships that rotate around the East Coast and the Pacific Islands with a two week turn around. Workers were able to get a vaccination at Port Botany and then get their second shots upon their return. Many of the workers come from South East Asia and the Philippines and were very grateful to receive the vaccine. Three out of six ships have been vaccinated. The vaccination program helps to keep the East Coast safe as well as vulnerable communities in the Pacific Islands. The program has been suspended and will resume once a higher proportion of the NSW population has been vaccinated. JL says that there has been a much more balanced flow of inbound and outbound containers through Port Botany at this time of the year compared with last year. There are no questions.	
8	Corporate Affairs update – Community Care Grants Program - SD	
8.1	SD updates the group on the inaugural grants program. SD says they are working through the final admin of the program now. SD says they will award over 20 grants to local groups and charities in Port Botany, Port Kembla, and nearby to the Enfield Intermodal Terminal operations. SD says they will be communicating in a few weeks and will ensure the membership of this group are included on this communication and suggested that members keep an eye on the NSW Ports social media channels because they will be showcasing those projects in the coming year.	
9	Port Authority: Port Botany community assets - CB	


Meeting Minutes

9.1	<p>CB says that given the latest lockdown, it has been a battle to keep maintenance going. CB says they have managed to keep the critical maintenance going e.g., cleaning and safety which is important to keep areas operable during lockdown since people enjoy walking in the local areas. CB says they have been managing the contractors and checking where they come from given the rules on certain LGAs.</p> <p>CB updates the group on an interesting project that Port Botany is undertaking with UNSW and the Gamay rangers (Indigenous rangers from the Botany Bay area). CB says the project is looking into reintroducing native sea grass. CB says they are the early stages of the project and are currently doing some trials to see if it can be transplanted back into the Bay.</p>	
10	Port Botany Expansion operation update (Patrick/Hutchison) – GM, DE	
10.1	<p>GM updates the group on behalf of Patrick. GM says they are working on installing automated cranes. GM says they started with a soft start going from manual to automated rail. GM says it has been successful implementation with some challenges. GM says they are moving on with construction with a new line to feed the automated area which will take 1 to 2 years. GM says it is exciting times with a massive uplift in the number of containers going through the rail.</p> <p>CA asks about the noise and the new automated cranes. CA asks if there is a human behind the automated crane and in his experience, they are not noisier.</p> <p>GM says the cranes work by exception. So, its automated but if there is an error it goes to a human at a help desk and the person can lower it down. GM says that in his experience that an automated system makes less noise than a manual system.</p> <p>DE says there are no updates from Hutchinson.</p>	
11	Tenant developments & round table updates – All & NSW Ports	
11.1	<p>On behalf of Origin, MK says thank you to the group because after operating at Port Botany since 1984, Origin will be leaving over the next 12 months. MK says they are currently decommissioning the gas facility over the next few months. MK says they will be freeing their assets of gas until November. Then demolition works will begin. The site will be given back by June 2022. MK says it has been a pleasure working with the neighbours.</p> <p>KJ says that Opal managed to get their annual maintenance shut down completed in June before lockdown began which was successful. KJ says that production is normal in lockdown except that non-essential staff are working from home. KJ says there has been an increase in odour complaints, so they are currently putting together an odour strategy which includes increasing community engagement to get information out to the community. KJ says they have engaged an odour consultant and they are going back to first principles.</p>	
12	EPA update - EB	
12.1	<p>EB says that the presentation by Sydney Water (see section 3) was arranged by EB due to community interest.</p> <p>Last meeting, EB says that Port Botany mentioned the noise investigation and that NSW Ports had done some work. EPA has also done its own independent investigation into low frequency noise unrelated to ships. EB says that the largest contributor to low frequency noise is shipping but other potential sources include cars, the airport, and maybe the paper mill. EB says Opal have been informed and will give a report. EB says that as part of the big picture, there are a range of stakeholders in the Port Botany noise working group with the aim of reducing noise for the residents.</p>	<p>EB says there is a local government update and EB will provide the weblink to everyone. EB says there is also a community webpage on the Opal site – EB will also provide the</p>

Meeting Minutes

	<p>EB says there have been a significant increase in odour complaints about the paper mill (see Opal's update, section 11.1). EB says they are treating the issue from the bigger picture, taking a holistic approach. EB says their investigation is hindered by covid-19 restrictions, but EB hopes it will be out soon.</p> <p>EB says that the EPA have received lots of community response on the paper mill co-generation proposal. EB says that this CCC is the EPA's preferred forum for communicating with the community. EB says that EPA is also happy to hear from community members about concerns, and the EPA is trying to understand how representative the complaints are.</p> <p>EB says there is a local government update and EB will provide the weblink to everyone. EB says there is also a community webpage on the Opal regulation site – EB will also provide the weblink for this page.</p>	weblink for this page.
13	Summary of complaints/incidents – BB – Port Botany noise update	
13.1	<p>BB reports of complaints. BB says that there have been 40 noise complaints in the last 3 months (11May – 10 August). Half of those complaints came from 2 people who have been in contact before. 3 complaints were not related to shipping noise.</p> <p>BB says there have been a few noisy events. Currently, Port Botany is trying to understand why some nights and not others are noisy and whether it is related to ships or lack of background noise. BB says he went out himself from 9pm – midnight to observe possible noise events during lockdown. BB said the lack of aircraft removed some background noise. BB says they are working with the EPA and moving to the next phase.</p> <p>BB says it is encouraging to have such good contributions from the community. BB says while not everyone is happy, it is a positive dialogue.</p> <p>BB says that only 2 odour complaints were reported since the last meeting. One was not related to a Port activity but linked to possible industrial activity nearby.</p> <p>BB says there have been no serious incidents. There was a minor incident when Extinction Rebellion created a blockade to protest fossil fuels. It caused no major havoc for the community and gave the Port 'food for thought' on how to manage blockages in the future when liaising with other groups like the NSW Police.</p> <p>BB says there was a road accident with a cyclist being hit by a truck. The cyclist suffered no major injuries and the Port liaised with the police on the matter.</p> <p>BB says the cameras on the Patrick Terminal wharf picked up a visit from a fox. The fox is not a biosecurity issue. BB says Patrick jumped straight onto the issue. BB says the Port liaised with Local Land Services, Patrick organised a fox trapper, and BB reported the fox using an app called Feral Scan where you can report non-native feral animals to help with trapping and baiting programs. A fox was later reported in Malabar. BB says it is good to keep foxes out of native bird habitats.</p> <p>BE says there used to be regular fox control. Is that to protect birds?</p> <p>CB says there is still a regular fox control.</p> <p>BE says that foxes are a known issue even on the Kamay Ferry Wharf project.</p> <p>Additionally, BE gives a quick update to inform the group that the ferry wharf project will be going to the 24th August with a hearing tonight. BE also says that Bayside is</p>	

Meeting Minutes

	collaborating with other councils to do a regional hazard risk assessment regarding expected sea level rises by 2110. BE says it is direct future threat assessment.	
14	Port Botany Expansion Rail Noise (as per CoA 2.28) - BB	
14.1	BB reports no rail noise expansion issues.	
15	Biosecurity - BB	
15.1	<p>No biosecurity issues.</p> <p>Other issues raised:</p> <p>CA updates the group on a proposal mentioned in the previous minutes to build 4000 units in Little Bay by Meriton which was assessed by the Sydney Eastern Planning Panel. CA says that the Planning Panel said there was no merit to the proposal. CA says that the developers could come back with a new proposal, but the 4000 units will not be going ahead in the future.</p> <p>CH says that Council will consider a submission about Kamay Ferry Wharf tomorrow night. CH says the Council is seeking new wharves at Brighton Le Sands and San Souci so western part of the bay is accessible.</p> <p>CH also says that the Metro Greenspace Spatial Framework will probably go to October Council meeting and includes Millstream, Botany Wetlands and Sir Joseph Banks Park.</p>	
17	Next Meeting	
17.1	<p>RR tells the group that the next meeting may be on Zoom due to tech issues on WebEx.</p> <p>Next meeting on November 16th 2021.</p>	
<p>These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair</p> <p>Signed: </p> <p>Date: 1st September 2021</p>		